



**AN ANALYSIS OF THREE ENGLISH TEXTBOOKS FOR ELEVENTH  
GRADE OF SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL**

**Nursakina Husen, RR Hasti Robiasih, Imam Ghozali**  
**Universitas Sarjanawiyata Tamansiswa**  
**(Naskah diterima: 1 September 2020, disetujui: 28 Oktober 2020)**

**Abstract**

*The objectives of this study were to: (1) see whether the textbooks used for learning English meet the criteria of a good textbook and (2) reveal the strengths and weaknesses of the textbook. This research was conducted using content analysis because the data were collected from textbooks. Observation data through and document analysis. The data were analyzed through qualitative research. The object of this research is the English textbook used for class XI SMA students. The results of the study found that English to stop bullying currently fulfills the twelve criteria of a good textbook by Mukundan containing 1) Books related to syllabus and curriculum, 2) Methodology, 3) Suitability with students, 4) Physical and utilitarian attributes, and 5 ) Efficient spending of complementary materials, 6) General, 7) Speaking, 8) Reading, 9) Writing, 10) Vocabulary, 11) Grammar, and 12). Furthermore, the study also found that the advantages of English in relation to current bullying are providing appropriate communicative activities with students, providing teachers' books, and samples of material that are familiar to students. Meanwhile, the weakness of this textbook is that it does not provide assignments to develop students' listening and pronunciation skills. Also, the text and images are not up-to-date.*

**Keywords:** Evaluation, English Textbook, Mukundan

**Abstrak**

Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk: (1) melihat apakah buku teks yang digunakan untuk pembelajaran bahasa Inggris telah memenuhi kriteria buku teks yang baik dan (2) mengungkap kekuatan dan kelemahan buku teks tersebut. Penelitian ini dilakukan dengan menggunakan analisis isi karena data yang dikumpulkan dari buku teks. Data observasi melalui dan analisis dokumen. Data tersebut dianalisis melalui penelitian kualitatif. Objek penelitian ini adalah buku teks Bahasa Inggris yang digunakan untuk siswa kelas XI SMA. Hasil penelitian menemukan bahwa bahasa Inggris menghentikan bullying saat ini memenuhi dua belas kriteria buku teks yang baik oleh Mukundan berisi 1) Buku yang berkaitan dengan silabus dan kurikulum, 2) Metodologi, 3) Kesesuaian dengan pelajar, 4) Atribut fisik dan utilitarian, dan 5 ) Pengeluaran yang efisien bahan pelengkap, 6) Umum, 7) Berbicara, 8) Membaca, 9) Menulis, 10) Kosakata, 11) Tata Bahasa, dan 12). Olahraga. Lebih lanjut, penelitian juga menemukan bahwa kelebihan bahasa Inggris dalam kaitannya dengan bullying saat ini adalah menyediakan kegiatan komunikatif yang sesuai dengan siswa, mereka menyediakan buku guru, dan contoh materi yang

diberikan sudah akrab dengan siswa. Sedangkan kelemahan buku teks ini adalah tidak disediakannya tugas untuk mengembangkan keterampilan menyimak dan pengucapan siswa. Selain itu, teks dan gambarnya tidak up-to-date.

**Kata kunci:** Evaluasi, Buku Teks Bahasa Inggris, Mukundan

## I. INTRODUCTION

**A**s the learning material, the textbook has important roles in teaching, first one is the basic resource to determine the quality of language input and the language practice. Second, a textbook can be a media to help teachers to achieve the goals of teaching-learning process, which is stated in the curriculum. As a media, the good textbook should relevant with the curriculum, so it will help the implementation of the curriculum itself. Last Textbooks also can be defined as a book prepared for school's students in teaching learning process.

Because of the variability of various commercial textbooks in the bookstores, English teachers are required to be able to evaluate textbooks in order to find out if they were still worth using or need replacing. In order to be able to evaluate the textbook, teacher should concern about the appropriateness of the material with the students need and meet the criteria of good textbook. Somehow, teachers in selecting their material only focus on the standard competence rather than student's

need or the suitability with the criteria of a good textbook.

The three textbook are claimed as the most used textbook and developed based on 2013 curriculum. The first one is "*Pathways to English*" Published by Yudistira. This textbook are used in SMAN 10 Tidore Kepulauan, and SMAN 1 Tidore Kepulauan. The second is "*Bahasa Inggris 2*" Published by Yrama Widya. This textbook was used in MA Mareku, and SMAN 10 Tidore Kepulauan. The last is a textbook developed by the Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia entitled "*Bahasa Inggris Stop Bullying Now*". Beside that, those textbooks are chosen based on several reasons, such as availability of the school library, the suitability of the content with basic competence, and the appearance of the textbooks.

The process of evaluating the textbooks can be done by examining the content of the textbooks. There are two ways to examining the content of the textbooks, as suggested by Mukundan et.all. (2011.104-105), the first is General evaluation focusses on the relation of

the curriculum, methodology, learners suitability, physical appearance and supplementary material. The other one is teaching learning content, it deals with material including the language used, four skill, and exercise. Based on the problem identified above, this research focused on evaluate the textbook to find the most suitable textbook that meet the criteria of good textbook.

## **II. LITERATURE REVIEW**

### **1. Teaching Learning In Indonesia**

In Indonesia, learners learn English as the foreign language. It has taught in Senior high school, Senior high school and University. Due to the globalization era, the teaching and learning English become the highlighted among the others foreign languages such, Japan, Korea, Arabic, France, and Chinese.

The implementation of teaching and learning in Indonesia are stated in the curriculum. The teacher should follow what is stated in the curriculum to achieve the goals of the teaching and learning process. The curriculum itself is a set of planning and setting of the objectives, contents, and the material of the teaching and learning process that is used as a guideline in realization of the teaching to achieve the goal of the certain education (UU

No. 20 Th. 2003 Tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional).

In curriculum 2013, the teaching process are using scientific approach. This scientific approach is a learning process that support creativity, there are some steps of the process of teaching using scientific approach as stated in the Regulation of Minister of Culture and Education Number 103 of 2014, they include observing, asking, exploration/ experiment, associating/analyzing, and communicating.

The content of the 2013 Curriculum is formed core competencies of class and followed by the basic competence of subjects. Core competence is the quality that must be owned by students in the class through basic competence which is organized in students' learning process. Basic competence is competence that must be learned by the students. This basic competence will be the reference for the teacher to write the syllabus and teaching-learning process.

In the implementation of the 2013 curriculum, teacher as one element in the success of the study should be able to understand the characteristics of the 2013 curriculum and the principles in the implementation of the 2013 curriculum.

## **2. Textbook**

In teaching and learning process, the term textbook refers to a set of an instructional material of English taught as subject matter at school. Generally, textbook is a book contains some material on certain subject to learn by the students. It is used as a main component to deliver the material framework designed in the curriculum. They may deliver the foundation for the content of the lessons, the balance of skills taught and the types of language practice the students take part in. In another hand, the textbook may provide primarily to supplement the teacher's instruction (Richards 2013).

### **a. The Roles of Textbooks**

Cunningsworth (1995) in Richards (2002) summarizes the role of materials, particularly course books in language teaching as:

- a. A resource for presentation materials (spoken and written)
- b. A source of activities for learner practice and communicative interaction
- c. A reference source for learners on grammar, vocabulary, pronunciation, and so forth
- d. A source of stimulation and ideas for classroom activities

- e. A syllabus where it reflects learning objectives that have already been determined
- f. A support for less experienced teachers who have yet to gain in confidence

Richards (2002) outlines the role of materials as follows:

- g. The materials provide the basis for the content of lessons, the balance of skills taught, and the kinds of language practice which students take part in.
- h. Materials serve primarily to supplement the teacher's instruction.
- i. For learners, materials may provide the major source of contact they have with the language apart from the teacher

### **b. Advantages and Disadvantages of Textbook**

Richards (2002) argue that textbook has a both advantages and disadvantages, depending on how they are use anf the context the are use. Among them the advantages are :

- a. They provide structure and syllabus for a program,
- b. They help standardize instruction,
- c. They maintain quality,
- d. They provide a variety of learning resource,
- e. They are efficient,

- f. They can provide effective language model and input,
- g. They can train teacher, and h0, they are visually appealing.

Beside the the advatages Richard (2002) also draw the disadvantages of textbook, they are :

- a. They may contain inauthentic language,
- b. They may distort content,
- c. They may not reflect students need,
- d. They cab deskill teachers, and
- e. They are expensive.

### **3. Criteria of good textbook**

Mukundan et.al (2011) proposed the model to examine the material evaluation. They derived into two stages, namely general attribute and learning teaching content. The criteria of general attribute is based on the curriculum or syllabus, the methodology used during the teaching learning process, the suitability to the learners, the physical appearance, and and teacher guide or supplementary materials. In other hand, the learning teaching context is a treatment and presentation of the skills, the task, sequencing and grading of the materials, and the realtionnship between text and exercise. In addtion Richard (2001) stated that evaluation can be done by considering something in purpose. A book may be ideal in one

situation because its matches the situation perfectly.

General attributes, serve as the first basis of textbook evaluation, comprise of five aspects. They include the book in relation to the curriculum which means the relation between textbook and the syllabus, methodology, suitability to the learners, physical and utilitarian attributes, and efficient outlay of supplementary materials. In other words, general attributes seek to answer questions in relation to the match between textbook and the syllabus, the methodologies employed, the compability of textbook to some factors related to the learners' needs, interests, and other background, the appropriateness of physical appearance, and the teacher's guide.

Learning-teaching content, deals with the content of textbook. This aspect covers nine major areas i.e. general, listening, speaking, reading, writing, vocabulary, grammar, pronunciation, and exercises. The general aspect of the book contains important aspects of tasks and language used in the book. The four skills should include listening, speaking, reading, and writing. All aspects should be graded, meaningful, appropriate, intresting, and based on the learners' needs. The grammar, vocabulary and pronunciation aspect should

also be contextualized, interesting, and easy to follow. In terms of exercises, they should have clear instructions, are adequate, and help all students who are under/over-achievers.

### **III. METHODOLOGY**

This research used content analysis technique because this research was focused on analysis the content of the textbooks. This study attempted to reveal the worthiness of English textbooks in two aspects. First, it attempted to discover whether the textbooks analyzed has met the criteria proposed by Mukundan, et.al (2011: 1004-105). Second, it also attempted to know the strengths and the weaknesseses of the textbooks.

The data were taken from three textbook for the eleven grade students of senior high school, the first one is textbooks entitled “*Bahasa Inggris 2*” written by Setiawan and Supeni, was published by Yrama widya. The second is “*Pathways to English*” written by Sudawarti, and Grace it was published by Yudistira. The last textbook was published by ministry entitled “*Bahasa Inggris Stop Bullying Now*”

The instrument of collecting data used in this study is a checklist proposed by Mukundan, et.al. (2011). The checklist covered two main aspects namely general attribute and learn-

ing teaching content. The two aspect then divided into Fourteen sub aspect. The general attribute aspect had five sub aspect namely, 1) The book in relation to syllabus and curriculum, 2) Methodology, 3)Suitability to learner, 4)Physical and utilitarian attributes and 5)Efficient outlay of supplementary materials. This sub items had sixteen criteria to be evaluated. The learning teaching content aspects had nine sub aspect to be evaluated. The nine sub aspects were 1)General, 2)Speaking, 3)Reading, 4)Listening, 5)Writing, 6)Vocabulary, 7)Grammar, 8)Pronunciation, and 9). Exercise.

In this research, the researcher used observation, document review and interview to collect the data. Meanwhile to analysed the data, the researcher used following step Based on Miles Huberman and Saldana (2014) such as:

1. Data Reduction
  - a. Classifying and describe the data based on the parts of the English textbooks related to the Mukundan criteria of good textbook by labeling them into suitable, partly suitable or not suitable
  - b. Identifiying the strengths and the weaknesses of the textbooks based on the

content of the textbooks related to the criteria fulfilments.

## 2. Data Display

Selected some activities, task or picture as the supporting evidence whether the content of the textbooks are appropriate with the Mukundan criteria of good textbook or not

## 3. Giving conclusion

## IV. RESULT

### **The suitability of the three textbooks with the criteria developed by Mukundan**

Data analysis provided in appendix 1 were taken from the three different textbooks, these three textbooks were claimed developed based on 2013 curriculum framework. The Textbook 1 is entitled “*Bahasa Inggris SMA/MA/SMK/MAK Kelas XI Stop Bullying now*” published by The Ministry of Education and

Culture. Textbook 2 is “*Pathways to English for SMA/MA Grade XI*” written by Sudawarti and Grace it was published by Yudistira. Textbook 3 is “*Bahasa dan Sastra Inggris 2*” written by Setiawan and Supeni and was published by Yrama widya.

Fourteen checklists were used to evaluate the aforementioned textbooks. The checklists consisted of 1). The book in relation to syllabus and curriculum, 2). Methodology, 3). Suitability to learner, 4). Physical and utilitarian attributes, 5). Efficient outlay of supplementary materials, 6). General, 7). Speaking, 8). Reading, 9). Listening, 10). Writing, 11). Vocabulary, 12). Grammar, 13). Pronunciation, 14). And Exercise. The following table is the summarize of the data analysis of the three English textbooks.

**Table 4.1 Summary of the suitability of the Bahasa Inggris Stop Bullying Now, Pathways to English and Bahasa Inggris 2**

Aspects of Evaluation	No	Sub Aspects of Evaluation	Suitability		
			T1	T2	T3
General Attribute	1	Relation to syllabus and curriculum	Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	2	Methodology	Partly Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	3	Suitability to the learners	Partly Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	4	Physical and utilitarian attributes	Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	5	Efficient outlay of supplementary material	Partly Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
Learning teaching content	1	General	Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	2	Listening	Not Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	3	Speaking	Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	4	Reading	Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	5	Writing	Partly Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	6	Vocabulary	Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	7	Grammar	Partly Suitable	Suitable	Partly Suitable

	8	Pronunciation	Not Suitable	Suitable	Suitable
	9	Exercise	Suitable	Partly Suitable	Partly Suitable
Conclusion			Partly suitable	Suitable	suitable

The table showed that, textbook 1 “*Bahasa Inggris Stop Bullying now*” is classified into partly suitable level because this textbook has meets twelve criteria out of fourteen criteria proposed by Mukundan. They are : 1)The book in relation to syllabus and curriculum, 2)Methodology, 3)Suitability to learner, 4)Physical and utilitarian attributes and 5)Efficient outlay of supplementary materials, 6)General, 7)Speaking, 8)Reading, 9)Writing, 10)Vocabulary, 11)Grammar, and 12). Exercise. Unfortunately this textbook fail to meet two items of this criteria such as, 10. Listening and 2). Pronunciation.

Textbook 2 “*Pathways to English*” is classified as suitable because this textbook has meets fourteen out of fourteen criteria proposed by Mukundan. They are : 1)The book in relation to syllabus and curriculum, 2)Methodology, 3)Suitability to learner, 4)Physical and utilitarian attributes and 5)Efficient outlay of supplementary materials, 6)General, 7)Speaking, 8)Reading, 9)Listening, 10)Writing, 11)Vocabulary, 12)Grammar, 13)Pronunciation, and 14).Exercise.

Textbook 3 “*Bahasa Inggris*” is classified into suitable level, because this textbook has meets this textbook has meets fourteen out of fourteen criteria proposed by Mukundan. They are : 1)The book in relation to syllabus and curriculum, 2)Methodology, 3)Suitability to learner, 4)Physical and utilitarian attributes and 5)Efficient outlay of supplementary materials, 6)General, 7)Speaking, 8)Reading, 9)Listening, 10)Writing, 11)Vocabulary, 12)Grammar, 13)Pronunciation, and 14). Exercise.

## **V. CONCLUSION**

The research problems provided in this research is the three English textbooks used by the eleven grade students of Senior High School appropriate with the criteria of good textbook proposed by Mukundan?. Based on the data finding and analyzing, the research concluded that the textbook 1 “*Bahasa Inggris Stop Bullying now*” has meets twelve criteria out of fourteen criteria and is partly suitable, Textbook 2 “*Pathways to English*” is classified as suitable because this textbook has meets fourteen out of fourteen criteria, and the last textbook “*Bahasa Inggris*” is classified

into suitable level, because this textbook has meets this textbook has meets fourteen out of fourteen criteria proposed by Mukundan.

## REFERENCES

Creswell, J. W. 2008. *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research.* (3rd ed.). New Jersey: Pearson

Cunningsworth, A. 1995. *Choosing Your Coursebook.* Oxford: Heinemann.

Hartoyo. 2011. *Curriculum and Material Development: syllabus/course outline.* Program Pasca Sarjana, Universitas Muhammadiyah Prof.DR. HAMKA

Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan. 2013. *Dokumen Kurikulum 2013.* Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan Nasional.

\_\_\_\_\_. 2016. *Dokumen Kurikulum 2016.* Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan Nasional.

Lawrence P.W. 2011. *Texbook evaluation : a Framework for Evaluating the Fitness of the Hongkong New Secondary School Curiiculum.* Hongkong : Hongkong University pers

Liamputtong, P. 2009. *Qualitative research methods (3rd Edition).* Autralia: Oxford University Press.

Littlejohn, A. 2005. *The analysis of language teaching materials : inside the Trojan horse.* In Tomlinson, B. (Ed). *Materials development in language teaching.* Cambridge : Cambridge University Press.

Miles, Mathew B. A. Michael Huberman. Jhonny Saldana 2014. *Qualitative Data Analysis: a methods sourcebook.* America: United States of America

Mukundan, J., Nimehchisalem, V, & Hajimohammadi, R. 2011. *Developing an English language textbook evaluation checklist : A focus group discussion.* International Journal of Humanities and Social Science, 1 (12), 100-106.

Richards, J.C. 2001. *Curriculum Development In Language Teaching.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

\_\_\_\_\_. 2002. *Curriculum Development in Language Teaching.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

\_\_\_\_\_. 2013. *Curriculum Approaches in Language Teaching: Forward, Central, and Backward Design.* RELC Journal 44

Sugiyono. 2010. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif dan R dan D.* Bandung : CV Alfabetta

Tomlinson, B. 2005. *Material Development in Language Taeching.* Cambridge : Cambridge University Press